

Further Studies on O₂-Resistant Photosynthesis and Photorespiration in a Tobacco Mutant with Enhanced Catalase Activity

Israel Zelitch

Department of Biochemistry and Genetics, The Connecticut Agricultural Experiment Station, P. O. Box 1106,
New Haven, Connecticut 06504

ABSTRACT

The increase in net photosynthesis in M₄ progeny of an O₂-resistant tobacco (*Nicotiana tabacum*) mutant relative to wild-type plants at 21 and 42% O₂ has been confirmed and further investigated. Self-pollination of an M₃ mutant produced M₄ progeny segregating high catalase phenotypes (average 40% greater than wild type) at a frequency of about 60%. The high catalase phenotype cosegregated precisely with O₂-resistant photosynthesis. About 25% of the F₁ progeny of reciprocal crosses between the same M₃ mutant and wild type had high catalase activity, whether the mutant was used as the maternal or paternal parent, indicating nuclear inheritance. In high-catalase mutants the activity of NADH-hydroxypyruvate reductase, another peroxisomal enzyme, was the same as wild type. The mutants released 15% less photorespiratory CO₂ as a percent of net photosynthesis in CO₂-free 21% O₂ and 36% less in CO₂-free 42% O₂ compared with wild type. The mutant leaf tissue also released less ¹⁴CO₂ per [1-¹⁴C]glycolate metabolized than wild type in normal air, consistent with less photorespiration in the mutant. The O₂-resistant photosynthesis appears to be caused by a decrease in photorespiration especially under conditions of high O₂ where the stoichiometry of CO₂ release per glycolate metabolized is expected to be enhanced. The higher catalase activity in the mutant may decrease the nonenzymatic peroxidation of keto-acids such as hydroxypyruvate and glyoxylate by photorespiratory H₂O₂.

In a recent paper (23), I described the selection of tobacco plants with O₂-resistant photosynthesis that differed in their characteristics from any previously reported. These plants showed a steady increase in net photosynthesis relative to wild-type plants on raising the O₂ level from 1% O₂ (where photosynthesis was the same) to 21% O₂ to 42% O₂ at 250 to 350 μ L CO₂ L⁻¹ and 30°C. Net CO₂ assimilation averaged about 15% greater than wild type in whole plants and leaf discs in 21% O₂. After two successive selfings of O₂-resistant plants, about 50% of the M₃ progeny showed O₂-resistant photosynthesis. Leaves of these plants averaged 40% greater catalase activity than wild type while glycolate oxidase activity, a closely related peroxisomal enzyme, was the same.

The results (23) were consistent with the view that the O₂-resistant plants released less photorespiratory CO₂ than wild type under conditions of high photorespiration relative to net photosynthesis, namely higher than normal O₂ and temperatures of 30°C or higher. There is evidence that high O₂ and

high temperatures increase greatly the stoichiometry of CO₂ release relative to the flux of the photorespiratory pathway (3–5). Values above the 'expected' 25%, which would occur during the conversion of 2 glycine to produce serine and CO₂, would then be observed. The hypothesis developed was that the 'excessive' CO₂ losses above the 25% expected, during conditions of high photorespiration relative to net photosynthesis, resulted from the peroxidation of glyoxylate and especially hydroxypyruvate by photorespiratory H₂O₂ (3, 19). Enhanced catalase activity could therefore diminish excess loss of CO₂ by reducing the level of peroxisomal H₂O₂.

In this study, the M₄ progeny of an O₂-resistant plant have been examined, and it is shown that high catalase activity cosegregates precisely with O₂-resistant photosynthesis, while siblings with normal catalase activity have photosynthetic characteristics typical of wild type. Progeny of reciprocal crosses of an O₂-resistant M₃ plant with wild type have been studied and show that the high catalase phenotype results from a nuclear mutation. Evidence in support of the view that the O₂-resistant mutants have a decreased photorespiratory CO₂ release under conditions of high photorespiration is also presented.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Plants and Photosynthesis Measurements

Tobacco (*Nicotiana tabacum*, L. cv Havana Seed) was grown in a greenhouse as previously described (23), and experiments were conducted on M₄ progeny of an M₃ plant with O₂-resistant photosynthesis originally derived from the M₁ plant designated as 42-12F (Fig. 1 in ref. 23). Studies were also conducted on progeny of reciprocal crosses made with the same M₃ plant.

Photosynthesis experiments were conducted with 18 1.6-cm leaf discs (0.36 dm² per leaf surface, about 720 mg fresh weight) floated upside down on a thin layer of water in a Petri plate. When comparing photosynthesis at 21 and 42% O₂ in segregating M₄ progeny, rates of net CO₂ uptake were measured at an irradiance of 500 μ mol photons m⁻² s⁻¹ using an open system in 1 L Plexiglas chambers continuously flushed with a water-saturated gas of fixed composition at about 30°C. In experiments in which photorespiratory release was also measured and when ¹⁴CO₂ arising from [1-¹⁴C]glycolate was collected, the leaf discs were placed in a 90 ml jacketed Plexiglas chamber at 650 μ mol photons m⁻² s⁻¹ and leaf

temperatures were controlled within 0.1° of 30°C by adjusting the temperature-controlled liquid circulating around the chamber (12).

Enzyme Assays

To assay catalase activity, one leaf disc (2.01 cm²) from near the leaf tip, frequently taken from the same sample used for photosynthetic measurements, was ground in a microcentrifuge tube fitted with a plastic pestle (Kontes, Vineland, NJ) containing 0.75 mL of ice-cold 0.05 M K phosphate buffer (0.05 M, pH 7.4) with 1.13 mg DTT (6). The suspension was centrifuged at 16,000g for 3 min, and the clear supernatant was assayed for catalase activity at 30°C by measuring the linear rate of decrease in absorbance of H₂O₂ at 240 nm. One unit is defined as the activity catalyzing the decomposition of 1 μmol H₂O₂ per min. Since high catalase activity was observed similarly on a fresh weight, protein, or leaf area basis (23), the specific activity was given as units per cm² leaf area. When comparing catalase activity in segregating plants, four discs from four different plants (three segregating progeny and one randomly selected wild type) were cut and extracted at the same time and assayed, and then another set was taken. In a single day, at least 15 segregating progeny and 5 wild-type plants were assayed. High catalase plants were defined as having activities at least 1 SD (67% of all observations) greater than the mean for wild-type plants assayed on that day.

Hydroxypyruvate reductase was assayed in the same extracts used for measuring catalase activity immediately after each set of catalase assays was completed. The reaction mixture (11, 18) consisted of 0.5 M K phosphate buffer (pH 6.4), 0.10 mL; 2 mM NADH, 0.10 mL; enzyme extract; and water to make the final volume 3.0 mL. After observing no oxidation of NADH at 30°C for 1 min, the reaction was initiated by the addition of 0.10 mL of 30 mM Li hydroxypyruvate, and the rate of NADH oxidation at 340 nm was determined. One unit is defined as the activity catalyzing the reduction of 1 μmol hydroxypyruvate per min.

Photorespiratory CO₂ and ¹⁴CO₂ Release from [1-¹⁴C] Glycolate

To measure photorespiratory release in CO₂-free 21 and 42% O₂, leaf discs in the temperature-controlled 90 mL chamber were floated upside down on water (leaf temperature 30°C) and flushed with water-saturated 21% O₂/350 μL CO₂ L⁻¹ at 1.75 L min⁻¹ until steady rates of net photosynthesis were obtained. The flushing gas was then changed to water-saturated CO₂-free 21% O₂ and the constant rate of CO₂ release (from about 5–20 min) was measured. The procedure was then repeated with the same discs using 42% O₂ and the same CO₂ concentrations as before in the same sequence. At the end of the experiment, mean stomatal widths were determined from silicone rubber impressions made on two discs as previously described (23).

To investigate ¹⁴CO₂ release from [1-¹⁴C]glycolate, steady rates of photosynthesis by 18 leaf discs floating upside down on water were first attained at 650 μmol photons m⁻² s⁻¹ leaf temperature 30°C, while the discs were flushed at 1.0 L min⁻¹

with 21% O₂/350 μL CO₂ L⁻¹. Most of the water was then removed with a hypodermic syringe while the discs remained in the light and 180 μL of 10 mM K [1-¹⁴C]glycolate (Amersham) (pH 5.0), containing 427,000 dpm (237,000 dpm/μmol) was quickly added next to the discs. Steady state photosynthesis was restored within several minutes, and in all experiments was identical in rate to that observed before addition of the tracer radioactive glycolate. The ¹⁴CO₂ released in the gas stream was collected in two traps in series each containing 70 mL of 2 M ethanolamine (3). Samples of the ethanolamine were removed at 15 or 20 min intervals from the first trap to determine that the rates of ¹⁴CO₂ release were constant, and from traps one and two after 60 min, from which a correction was made based on the efficiency of trapping (3). The experiments were terminated after 60 min, the discs were killed in 20 mL boiling 20% ethanol containing 10 mM NaHSO₃, and the killed discs homogenized and made to a known volume. Small samples were removed to determine total ¹⁴C by scintillation counting. The homogenate was centrifuged at high speed and the residue washed twice by centrifugation. Radioactive glycolate was determined by elution of the extract on a column of Dowex-1 acetate ion exchange resin with 4 N acetic acid (17). The ¹⁴C-glycolate metabolized was calculated from the total ¹⁴C in the homogenate minus the ¹⁴C remaining in glycolic acid.

RESULTS

Cosegregation of O₂-Resistant Photosynthesis with High Catalase Activity

Previous work demonstrated that M₃ progeny of an O₂-resistant tobacco line averaged about 40% greater catalase activity on a fresh weight, protein, or leaf area basis (23). This correlation was further tested in M₄ progeny (Table I). Net photosynthesis was determined in atmospheres containing 250 μL CO₂ L⁻¹ at 21% O₂ and 42% O₂ in six segregants previously identified as having high catalase activity and in six segregants with normal (wild-type) catalase activity. In every case the segregants with high catalase activity, which was determined from the same sample of leaf discs used for the photosynthesis measurements, showed a sizeable increase in the net photosynthesis ratio of segregant/wild-type on going from 21 to 42% O₂. Plants with high catalase activity averaged 40% more than wild type. Segregants with normal catalase activity, on the other hand, did not differ from wild type.

Inheritance of High Catalase Activity in M₄ Progeny and in Crosses with Wild Type

Catalase activities were assayed in leaf discs taken from M₄ seedling progeny derived from self-pollination of an M₃ mutant (Table II). High catalase activity was found in 25 out of 42 plants assayed (60%). Since O₂-resistant photosynthesis is perfectly correlated with high catalase activity (Table I), one can assume that about 60% of the progeny in this generation had O₂-resistant photosynthesis as well. This probably represents an increase from the M₂ and M₃ generation, in which fewer progeny showed O₂ resistance (23).

Reciprocal crosses between the same M₃ mutant and a wild-

Table I. Cosegregation of O₂-Resistant Photosynthesis with High Catalase Activity in M₄ Progeny of an O₂-Resistant Plant

Net photosynthesis and catalase activity were determined on the same day on leaf discs cut from the same leaf (6–13 g fresh weight) of segregating plants previously identified as having high or wild-type enzyme activity. Each of the segregating progeny was compared with a randomly selected wild-type plant. A two-way analysis of variance was conducted for net photosynthesis at 21 and 42% O₂ in leaf discs of segregating *versus* wild-type plants. In each comparison, at least five determinations were made under steady-state conditions.

Individual Plant Assayed	Net Photosynthesis		Catalase Activity
	21% O ₂	42% O ₂	
<i>Segregant/WT</i>			
Segregants with high catalase activity			
1	1.07 **	1.23 **	1.41
2	0.99 NS	1.10 NS	1.38
3	1.16 ***	1.47 ***	1.58
4	0.95 **	1.27 **	1.31
5	1.09 *	1.25 **	1.32
6	1.05 NS	1.18 **	1.39
Mean six plants	1.05	1.25	1.40
Segregants with normal catalase activity			
1	0.99 NS	0.92 NS	1.05
2	0.84 **	0.86 **	0.83
3	0.98 NS	1.02 NS	0.97
4	0.76 **	0.78 *	0.95
5	0.88 *	0.86 *	0.96
6	0.95 NS	0.89 NS	1.09
Mean six plants	0.90	0.89	0.98

* P < 0.05; ** P < 0.01; *** P < 0.001.

* P < 0.05; ** P < 0.01; *** P < 0.001.

type parent produced F₁ progeny segregating high catalase phenotypes at a frequency of about 25% regardless of the direction of the cross (Table II).

Catalase and Hydroxypyruvate Reductase Activities in High Catalase Mutants

I reported previously that plants with high catalase had normal glycolate oxidase activity (23). To further establish that high catalase levels do not reflect a general alteration in activity of peroxisomal enzymes, the activity of NADH-hydroxypyruvate reductase (15) was determined in the same extracts used to assay catalase. Both enzymatic rates were determined in M₄ progeny (*n* = 7) with high catalase, each on two separate days, and in randomly selected wild-type plants (Table III). Mutants averaged about 40% higher catalase activity than wild type, and an analysis of variance showed the difference was very highly significant (*P* < 0.001). However, hydroxypyruvate reductase activity was the same in wild-type and mutant plants.

Photorespiratory CO₂ Release in Wild Type and Mutants with High Catalase Activity

The hypothesis that O₂-resistant photosynthesis described here is caused by a decrease of photorespiratory CO₂ release was tested by measuring CO₂ efflux in light in a rapid stream of CO₂-free 21 and 42% O₂. The advantages and limitations

Table II. Segregation for High Catalase Activity in Progeny of an O₂-Resistant M₃ Plant and in Reciprocal Crosses between the M₃ Plant and Wild-Type (WT)

Catalase (CAT) assays were conducted in extracts of leaf discs of greenhouse-grown leaves (2–5 g fresh weight). The month in which the assays were conducted is shown for each planting. Plants with high catalase had activities 1 sd or greater above the means of wild-type plants assayed on the same day.

Planting	Number of Plants with High CAT	Number of Plants Tested	High Catalase Plants %
M ₄ progeny			
1 (November)	10	16	
2 (February)	8	14	
3 (May)	7	12	
Total	25	42	60
(M ₃ mutant × WT) progeny			
1 (December)	4	16	
2 (February)	5	18	
Total	9	34	26
(WT × M ₃ mutant) progeny			
1 (December)	3	8	
2 (February)	3	16	
Total	6	24	25

of this assay of photorespiration have been discussed by me earlier (20). It has been used as a photorespiration assay in experiments with a photorespiratory mutant of *Arabidopsis* by others who concluded that the stoichiometry does not increase (14). The CO₂-efflux in CO₂-free 21% O₂ was shown to nearly double from 13 to 28°C as a percent of net photosynthesis in wheat leaves (10), consistent with the response of photorespiratory CO₂ in other assays.

Table IV shows results with four high-catalase M₄ mutants and four randomly selected wild-type plants regarding net photosynthesis in 21 and 42% O₂ and their photorespiratory CO₂ release in CO₂-free 21 and 42% O₂. The net photosynthesis ratio in the mutants/wild type increased greatly on going from 21 to 42% O₂ demonstrating their O₂ resistance. In 42% O₂, the mean absolute efflux of CO₂ was greater in wild type in three of the four experiments, and in experiment 4 it was significantly greater (*P* < 0.001). As a percent of net photosynthesis, there was a regular threefold increase in the photorespiratory CO₂ released per unit of net photosynthesis in wild-type, and a twofold increase in mutant leaf discs. In 21% O₂, the photorespiratory CO₂ released by the mutant averaged 15% less on a net photosynthesis basis than wild type (*P* < 0.05), while in 42% O₂, the photorespiratory CO₂ released by the mutant averaged 36% less than wild type (*P* < 0.001). Thus, O₂ resistance could be associated with decreased photorespiration as a percent of net photosynthesis, especially at higher O₂ levels.

Since such results on photorespiratory CO₂ release could have resulted from increased stomatal diffusive resistance in the mutant, at the end of each experiment stomatal widths were determined on two leaf discs. Stomatal numbers per unit leaf area were the same in wild-type and M₃ mutant plants (23). It was found (Table IV) that stomatal widths were the

Table III. Comparison of Catalase (CAT) and Hydroxypyruvate Reductase (HPR) Activities in Seven Progeny from the Third Selfing of an O₂-Resistant Plant and in Wild-Type Plants (WT)

Both enzymes were assayed in the same extract of a leaf disc cut from plants earlier identified as having high CAT activity. The extracts were made from each plant twice, each time on a different day, and compared with assays of extracts from randomly selected wild-type plants prepared at the same time. An analysis of variance was conducted on assays from high-CAT plants versus wild-type.

Mean CAT Activity		CAT Activity	Mean HPR Activity		HPR Activity
High CAT plants	WT plants		High CAT plants	WT plants	
units/cm ²		high CAT/WT	units/cm ²		high CAT/WT
288 ***	210	1.37	0.703 NS	0.721	0.98

*** P < 0.001.

same or greater in the mutants than wild type, thus ruling out this explanation of the results.

Release of ¹⁴CO₂ from Tracer [1-¹⁴C]Glycolate

If O₂ resistance is associated with decreased photorespiration, one should obtain less ¹⁴CO₂ release from [1-¹⁴C]glycolate supplied to intact leaf tissue which would label C-1 of glycine as well as glyoxylate and hydroxypyruvate. To test this hypothesis under physiological conditions, the label was provided to leaf discs being flushed with 21% O₂/350 μL CO₂ L⁻¹ at 30°C and the ¹⁴CO₂ released was measured with time.

In all experiments (Table V) the rate of ¹⁴CO₂ produced was constant with time, indicating that the photorespiratory pools equilibrated rapidly with the radioactive glycolate. The high catalase M₄ mutants released about 19% less ¹⁴CO₂ than did the wild type, indicating that even at 30°C in 21% O₂ they produce less photorespiratory CO₂ per glycolate metabolized.

DISCUSSION

Although the pathway of photorespiration is now well defined, there appears still to be a great deal to learn concerning its regulation. One approach would be to increase the CO₂/O₂ specificity of ribulose biphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (8), but it is still uncertain whether this can be achieved. Earlier observations that peroxisomal H₂O₂ could decarboxylate keto-acids such as glyoxylate and hydroxypyruvate (17, 19, 24) suggested, however, that a fixed stoichiometry of CO₂ release per glycolate oxidized was unlikely. Peroxisomes contain large amounts of catalase, but it may be inefficient in removing low concentrations of hydrogen peroxide (2).

Hanson and Peterson (3–5) have made simultaneous measurements of photorespiration based on a stereochemical probe and the postillumination CO₂ exchange transient in tobacco leaf discs under a number of conditions well removed from the CO₂ compensation point. To reconcile the differing trends in their estimates (Fig. 6 in ref. 3), they assumed a variable stoichiometry. They concluded that at 25°C, 21% O₂, and 340 μL CO₂ L⁻¹, the stoichiometry was close to the expected 25% (5), however, raising the temperature to 32°C and the O₂ to

Table IV. Net Photosynthesis (PS) and Photorespiratory CO₂ Release by Leaf Discs in CO₂-Free 21% O₂ and 42% O₂ in Wild-Type (WT) Plants and Mutants with High Catalase (CAT) Activity

At the end of the experiments silicone rubber impressions were made on the exposed leaf disc surface to determine stomatal widths. Discs from a different WT and high CAT plant were compared on the same day in each experiment. Plants from a segregating population from the third selfing with high CAT activity relative to WT were identified 2 to 3 weeks prior to these experiments in greenhouse-grown plants. An analysis of variance compared mean net photosynthesis and mean stomatal widths in WT with high CAT plants.

Experiment No. ^a	Plant Type	Net PS		CO ₂ Release	
		21% O ₂	42% O ₂	CO ₂ -free 21% O ₂	CO ₂ -free 42% O ₂
		mg CO ₂ dm ⁻² h ⁻¹		% net PS	
1	WT	23.2	11.1	15.0	45.0
	CAT	29.3 ***	18.9 ***	12.9	26.5
	Ratio CAT/WT ^b	1.26	1.70		
2	WT	29.5	16.4	16.4	45.2
	CAT	31.9 NS	21.8 ***	13.5	30.6
	Ratio CAT/WT	1.08	1.33		
3	WT	27.6	17.6	18.8	40.8
	CAT	36.6 ***	27.3 ***	14.2	27.3
	Ratio CAT/WT	1.33	1.55		
4	WT	34.5	17.0	16.8	48.5
	CAT	32.1 NS	23.3 *	16.0	30.0
	Ratio CAT/WT	0.93	1.37		
	Mean, WT			16.8	44.9
	Mean, high CAT			14.2 *	28.6 ***

^a In experiment 1 mean stomatal widths for WT and high CAT, respectively, were 1.0 μm and 1.2 μm *; in experiment 2, 3.7 μm and 2.8 μm NS; in experiment 3, 4.7 μm and 5.8 μm *; in experiment 4, 3.2 μm and 4.4 μm *. ^b The catalase activity ratio of plants with high CAT/randomly selected WT was 1.37 for the plant in experiment 1, 1.29 in experiment 2, 1.47 in experiment 3, and 1.37 in experiment 4. * P < 0.05; *** P < 0.001.

42% produced results consistent with a carbon ratio stoichiometry, CO₂/glycolate, of 55%. Thus, the stoichiometry of photorespiration may not be fixed. They pointed out (3) that the nonenzymatic peroxidation of hydroxypyruvate (which yields glycolate and CO₂) could result in a stoichiometry of 100% while that resulting from peroxidation of glyoxylate (yielding formate and CO₂) would be 25% unless the formate is also oxidized to CO₂. Hanson and Peterson (3) also suggested that increasing the catalase content of peroxisomes could decrease the stoichiometry of photorespiration under conditions where it exceeds 25%.

The mutant plants obtained in the M₄ generation averaged about 40% greater catalase activity than wild type and this activity cosegregated with O₂-resistant photosynthesis (Tables I and IV). Data in Table II show that about 60% of the M₄ progeny of an O₂-resistant M₃ plant had high catalase. However, only about 25% of the progeny of reciprocal crosses with wild type have high catalase, whether the mutant was used as the maternal or paternal parent. This indicates that high catalase is controlled by a nuclear gene.

Two other peroxisomal enzymes, glycolate oxidase (23) and NADH-hydroxypyruvate reductase (Table III), have the same activities in the mutant plants as in wild-type, indicating that

Table V. Release of $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ from Tracer $[1-^{14}\text{C}]$ Glycolate Supplied to Photosynthesizing Leaf Discs of Wild-Type and High-Catalase M_4 Tobacco in 21% O_2

Steady rates of photosynthesis were first attained with leaf discs floated upside down on water, and $[1-^{14}\text{C}]$ glycolate was quickly added to the discs. The experiments were terminated after 60 min and the ^{14}C -glycolate converted to other products was determined. The mean photosynthesis rates \pm SD are given during the treatment with $[1-^{14}\text{C}]$ glycolate and the number of determinations are shown in parentheses.

Plant Type	Mean Photosynthesis Rate	$^{14}\text{CO}_2$ Released	$[1-^{14}\text{C}]$ Glycolate Metabolized	$^{14}\text{CO}_2$ Released/ $[1-^{14}\text{C}]$ Glycolate Metabolized
	$\text{mg CO}_2 \text{ dm}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$		nmol h^{-1}	
Wild-type				
1	30.4 ± 0.6 (5)	65.8	300	0.22
2	31.7 ± 1.2 (6)	61.2	304	0.20
High catalase				
1	32.4 ± 0.6 (4)	59.4	342	0.17
2	33.7 ± 1.7 (7)	56.1	333	0.17

the high catalase levels do not result from a general increase in activity of peroxisomal enzymes. This further supports the specific nature of the mutation.

Tobacco has at least two catalase isozymes (6, 7), including one primarily with catalatic activity (CAT-1) and one with enhanced peroxidatic activity (CAT-3). The tobacco mutants with enhanced catalase activity contain both isozymes, and on the basis of preliminary analyses it was not possible to determine whether their proportion was altered in comparison with wild type (E Havir, personal communication).

Besides the studies cited above, there are considerable data in the literature indicating that the stoichiometry of photorespiration is not fixed (1, 16, 17). The argument for a fixed stoichiometry is based on experiments which may have alternative interpretations. For example, Somerville and Ogren (14) described studies with a mutant of *Arabidopsis* that lacked the enzyme in the photorespiratory pathway converting glycine to serine and CO_2 . This mutant can therefore make glyoxylate but presumably cannot make hydroxypyruvate. Leaves of the mutant released 30% as much photorespiratory CO_2 into CO_2 -free 50% O_2 as wild type from peroxidation of glyoxylate, and adding NH_4^+ suppressed CO_2 release from the mutant but had no effect on the wild type. They concluded that glyoxylate could be oxidized to CO_2 only when there were insufficient amino groups for transamination of glyoxylate to glycine. The experiments actually demonstrated that NH_4^+ does not limit the conversion of glyoxylate to glycine in wild type and say nothing about how much peroxidation of glyoxylate takes place in wild type.

This appears to be another example (22) of the limitations of deletion mutants, which accumulate metabolites in unusual concentrations and thereby alter metabolism, for extrapolating to rates of reactions taking place in wild type. These experiments were conducted with a mutant that does not

produce hydroxypyruvate which is the keto-acid substrate for peroxidation most likely to produce a higher stoichiometry.

Kendall *et al.* (9) have also concluded that their experiments with a catalase-deficient barley mutant were consistent with a fixed stoichiometry of photorespiration. They proposed that in the near absence of catalase, one should expect a far greater proportion of $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ to be released as a percent of $[1-^{14}\text{C}]$ glycolate metabolized. Their results showed less $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ was released in CO_2 -free air by the mutant, consistent with their conclusion, but experiments in normal air showed a 17% greater release of $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ by the mutant (Table 2 in ref. 9). The latter results are similar to those in Table V which show wild-type plants, with 40% less catalase than the mutants, released 24% more $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ per ^{14}C -glycolate metabolized.

The initial selection of plants with O_2 -resistant growth was made for the purpose of obtaining plants with a decreased rate of photorespiration (21, 23). The tobacco mutants described here averaged 15% less photorespiratory CO_2 release than wild type when expressed as a percent of net photosynthesis in 21% O_2 and 36% less in 42% O_2 (Table IV). The results were not caused by decreased stomatal diffusion of the mutants. The relative decrease in photorespiratory CO_2 per unit of net photosynthesis at higher O_2 is consistent with the hypothesis that the O_2 -resistant photosynthesis in the mutants is caused by a decreased photorespiration, especially under conditions where the stoichiometry of photorespiration is expected to increase. The experiments in Table V, in which the photorespiratory pathway was labeled by supplying tracer quantities of $[1-^{14}\text{C}]$ glycolate, show that even at 30°C in normal air, mutants with higher catalase activities released 19% less $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ than wild type. These results are also consistent with the mutant having a lower photorespiratory CO_2 release.

On successive selfings of an M_1 O_2 -resistant plant the percent of progeny with O_2 -resistance appears to have increased (23) to about 60% found in M_4 progeny (Table II). In the amphiploid *N. tabacum* pairing and recombination can take place between homeologous chromosomes of different genomes (13). Mutations may segregate into an array of heterozygous genotypes upon selfing if the chromosome can pair with its nonmutated partner in the other genome. Continued selection of resistant individuals for selfing would then be expected to gradually increase the frequency of the mutant gene(s). Eventually, one would expect to produce a population that breeds true for the resistance phenotype and may in the homozygous state display an even greater enhancement of catalase levels than has been observed in progeny of the M_3 and M_4 generations. Such mutants might show more O_2 resistance with still higher net CO_2 uptake per unit leaf area.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I wish to thank Drs. Kenneth R. Hanson, Evelyn A. Havir, Richard K. Kiyomoto, and Richard B. Peterson for their helpful counsel and experimental advice; Dr. Neil A. McHale also for making the crosses; and Caroline A. Mallick for assistance with stomatal measurements.

LITERATURE CITED

- Gaudillere M, Jolivet-Tournier P, Costes C (1983) Contribution of glycerate dehydrogenase activity to the production of photorespiratory metabolites in higher plants. *Physiol Veg* 21: 1115-1124

2. **Halliwel B** (1984) Chloroplast Metabolism. The Structure and Function of Chloroplasts in Green Leaf Cells. Clarendon Press, Oxford, p 185
3. **Hanson KR, Peterson RB** (1985) The stoichiometry of photorespiration during C₃-photosynthesis is not fixed: evidence from combined physical and stereochemical methods. *Arch Biochem Biophys* **237**: 300–313
4. **Hanson KR, Peterson RB** (1986) Regulation of photorespiration in leaves: evidence that the fraction of ribulose biphosphate oxygenated is conserved and stoichiometry fluctuates. *Arch Biochem Biophys* **246**: 332–346
5. **Hanson KR, Peterson RB** (1987) Stereospecifically tritiated glycinate as a probe of photorespiratory metabolism. In J Biggins, ed, *Progress in Photosynthesis Research*, Vol III. Martinus Nijhoff, Dordrecht, pp 549–556
6. **Havir EA, McHale NA** (1987) Biochemical and developmental characterization of multiple forms of catalase in tobacco leaves. *Plant Physiol* **84**: 450–455
7. **Havir EA, McHale NA** (1989) Regulation of catalase activity in leaves of *Nicotiana glauca* by high CO₂. *Plant Physiol* **89**: 952–957
8. **Jordan DB, Ogren WL** (1981) Species variation in the specificity of ribulose biphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase. *Nature* **291**: 513–515
9. **Kendall AC, Keys AJ, Turner JC, Lea PJ, Mifflin BJ** (1983) The isolation and characterisation of a catalase-deficient mutant of barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.). *Planta* **159**: 505–511
10. **Keys AJ, Sampaio EVSB, Cornelius MJ, Bird IF** (1977) Effect of temperature on photosynthesis and photorespiration in wheat leaves. *J Exp Bot* **28**: 525–533
11. **Kleczkowski LA, Randall DD** (1988) Purification and characterization of a novel NADPH (NADH)-dependent hydroxypyruvate reductase from spinach leaves. Comparison of immunological properties of leaf hydroxypyruvate reductases. *Biochem J* **250**: 145–152
12. **Peterson RB** (1983) Estimation of photorespiration based on the initial rate of postillumination CO₂ release. I. A nonsteady state model for measurement of CO₂ exchange transients. *Plant Physiol* **73**: 978–982
13. **Smith HH** (1968) Recent cytogenetic studies in the genus *Nicotiana*. *Adv Genet* **14**: 1–54
14. **Somerville CR, Ogren WL** (1981) Photorespiration-deficient mutants of *Arabidopsis thaliana* lacking mitochondrial serine transhydroxymethylase activity. *Plant Physiol* **67**: 666–671
15. **Tolbert NE** (1981) Metabolic pathways in peroxisomes and glyoxysomes. *Annu Rev Biochem* **50**: 133–157
16. **Walton NJ, Butt VS** (1981) Metabolism and decarboxylation of glycolate and serine in leaf peroxisomes. *Planta* **153**: 225–231
17. **Zelitch I** (1972) The photooxidation of glyoxylate by envelope-free spinach chloroplasts and its relation to photorespiration. *Arch Biochem Biophys* **150**: 698–707
18. **Zelitch I** (1978) Effect of glycidate, an inhibitor of glycolate synthesis in leaves, on the activity of some enzymes of the glycolate pathway. *Plant Physiol* **61**: 236–241
19. **Zelitch I** (1979) Photosynthesis and plant productivity. *Chem Eng News* **57**(5): 28–48
20. **Zelitch I** (1979) Photorespiration: studies with whole tissues. In M Gibbs, E Latzko, eds, *Encyclopedia of Plant Physiology*, Vol 6: Photosynthesis II. Springer, Berlin, pp 353–367
21. **Zelitch I** (1987) Photosynthetic characteristics of haploid tobacco plantlets selected for resistance to oxygen stress. In J Biggins, ed, *Progress in Photosynthesis Research*, Vol III. Martinus Nijhoff, Dordrecht, pp 621–624
22. **Zelitch I** (1988) Synthesis of glycolate from pyruvate via isocitrate lyase by tobacco leaves in light. *Plant Physiol* **86**: 463–468
23. **Zelitch I** (1989) Selection and characterization of tobacco plants with novel O₂-resistant photosynthesis. *Plant Physiol* **90**: 1457–1464
24. **Zelitch I, Ochoa S** (1953) Oxidation and reduction of glycolic and glyoxylic acids in plants. I. Glycolic acid oxidase. *J Biol Chem* **201**: 707–718